

1 Michael F. Ram (SBN 104805)  
 2 mram@forthepeople.com  
 3 Marie N. Appel (SBN 187483)  
 4 mappel@forthepeople.com  
 5 MORGAN & MORGAN  
 6 COMPLEX LITIGATION GROUP  
 7 711 Van Ness Avenue, Suite 500  
 8 San Francisco, CA 94102  
 9 Telephone: (415) 358-6913  
 10 Telephone: (415) 358-6293

11 [Additional Counsel Listed on Signature Page]

12 *Attorneys for Plaintiff and the Proposed Class*

13 Michael S. Sommer (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
 14 JaeYoung Ariel Jeong (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
 15 Derek K. Mong (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
 16 WILSON SONSINI GOODRICH & ROSATI  
 17 Professional Corporation  
 18 1301 Avenue of the Americas, 40th Floor  
 19 New York, NY 10019-6022  
 20 Telephone: (212) 999-5800  
 21 Facsimile: (212) 999-5899  
 22 Email: msommer@wsgr.com  
 23 ajeong@wsgr.com  
 24 dmong@wsgr.com

25 [Additional Counsel Listed on Signature Page]

26 *Attorneys for Defendant Cognism Inc.*

27  
 28 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
 29 NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

30 NICHOLAS KIS, on behalf of himself and all ) Case Number: 4:22-cv-05322-JST  
 31 others similarly situated, )  
 32 Plaintiff(s), ) The Honorable Jon S. Tigar  
 33 vs. )  
 34 COGNISM INC., ) **JOINT CASE MANAGEMENT**  
 35 Defendant. ) **STATEMENT & [PROPOSED] ORDER**  
 36 )  
 37 ) Complaint Filed: September 20, 2022  
 38 )  
 39 )  
 40 )  
 41 )  
 42 )  
 43 )  
 44 )  
 45 )  
 46 )  
 47 )  
 48 )  
 49 )  
 50 )  
 51 )  
 52 )  
 53 )  
 54 )  
 55 )  
 56 )  
 57 )  
 58 )  
 59 )  
 60 )  
 61 )  
 62 )  
 63 )  
 64 )  
 65 )  
 66 )  
 67 )  
 68 )  
 69 )  
 70 )  
 71 )  
 72 )  
 73 )  
 74 )  
 75 )  
 76 )  
 77 )  
 78 )  
 79 )  
 80 )  
 81 )  
 82 )  
 83 )  
 84 )  
 85 )  
 86 )  
 87 )  
 88 )  
 89 )  
 90 )  
 91 )  
 92 )  
 93 )  
 94 )  
 95 )  
 96 )  
 97 )  
 98 )  
 99 )  
 100 )  
 101 )  
 102 )  
 103 )  
 104 )  
 105 )  
 106 )  
 107 )  
 108 )  
 109 )  
 110 )  
 111 )  
 112 )  
 113 )  
 114 )  
 115 )  
 116 )  
 117 )  
 118 )  
 119 )  
 120 )  
 121 )  
 122 )  
 123 )  
 124 )  
 125 )  
 126 )  
 127 )  
 128 )  
 129 )  
 130 )  
 131 )  
 132 )  
 133 )  
 134 )  
 135 )  
 136 )  
 137 )  
 138 )  
 139 )  
 140 )  
 141 )  
 142 )  
 143 )  
 144 )  
 145 )  
 146 )  
 147 )  
 148 )  
 149 )  
 150 )  
 151 )  
 152 )  
 153 )  
 154 )  
 155 )  
 156 )  
 157 )  
 158 )  
 159 )  
 160 )  
 161 )  
 162 )  
 163 )  
 164 )  
 165 )  
 166 )  
 167 )  
 168 )  
 169 )  
 170 )  
 171 )  
 172 )  
 173 )  
 174 )  
 175 )  
 176 )  
 177 )  
 178 )  
 179 )  
 180 )  
 181 )  
 182 )  
 183 )  
 184 )  
 185 )  
 186 )  
 187 )  
 188 )  
 189 )  
 190 )  
 191 )  
 192 )  
 193 )  
 194 )  
 195 )  
 196 )  
 197 )  
 198 )  
 199 )  
 200 )  
 201 )  
 202 )  
 203 )  
 204 )  
 205 )  
 206 )  
 207 )  
 208 )  
 209 )  
 210 )  
 211 )  
 212 )  
 213 )  
 214 )  
 215 )  
 216 )  
 217 )  
 218 )  
 219 )  
 220 )  
 221 )  
 222 )  
 223 )  
 224 )  
 225 )  
 226 )  
 227 )  
 228 )  
 229 )  
 230 )  
 231 )  
 232 )  
 233 )  
 234 )  
 235 )  
 236 )  
 237 )  
 238 )  
 239 )  
 240 )  
 241 )  
 242 )  
 243 )  
 244 )  
 245 )  
 246 )  
 247 )  
 248 )  
 249 )  
 250 )  
 251 )  
 252 )  
 253 )  
 254 )  
 255 )  
 256 )  
 257 )  
 258 )  
 259 )  
 260 )  
 261 )  
 262 )  
 263 )  
 264 )  
 265 )  
 266 )  
 267 )  
 268 )  
 269 )  
 270 )  
 271 )  
 272 )  
 273 )  
 274 )  
 275 )  
 276 )  
 277 )  
 278 )  
 279 )  
 280 )  
 281 )  
 282 )  
 283 )  
 284 )  
 285 )  
 286 )  
 287 )  
 288 )  
 289 )  
 290 )  
 291 )  
 292 )  
 293 )  
 294 )  
 295 )  
 296 )  
 297 )  
 298 )  
 299 )  
 300 )  
 301 )  
 302 )  
 303 )  
 304 )  
 305 )  
 306 )  
 307 )  
 308 )  
 309 )  
 310 )  
 311 )  
 312 )  
 313 )  
 314 )  
 315 )  
 316 )  
 317 )  
 318 )  
 319 )  
 320 )  
 321 )  
 322 )  
 323 )  
 324 )  
 325 )  
 326 )  
 327 )  
 328 )  
 329 )  
 330 )  
 331 )  
 332 )  
 333 )  
 334 )  
 335 )  
 336 )  
 337 )  
 338 )  
 339 )  
 340 )  
 341 )  
 342 )  
 343 )  
 344 )  
 345 )  
 346 )  
 347 )  
 348 )  
 349 )  
 350 )  
 351 )  
 352 )  
 353 )  
 354 )  
 355 )  
 356 )  
 357 )  
 358 )  
 359 )  
 360 )  
 361 )  
 362 )  
 363 )  
 364 )  
 365 )  
 366 )  
 367 )  
 368 )  
 369 )  
 370 )  
 371 )  
 372 )  
 373 )  
 374 )  
 375 )  
 376 )  
 377 )  
 378 )  
 379 )  
 380 )  
 381 )  
 382 )  
 383 )  
 384 )  
 385 )  
 386 )  
 387 )  
 388 )  
 389 )  
 390 )  
 391 )  
 392 )  
 393 )  
 394 )  
 395 )  
 396 )  
 397 )  
 398 )  
 399 )  
 400 )  
 401 )  
 402 )  
 403 )  
 404 )  
 405 )  
 406 )  
 407 )  
 408 )  
 409 )  
 410 )  
 411 )  
 412 )  
 413 )  
 414 )  
 415 )  
 416 )  
 417 )  
 418 )  
 419 )  
 420 )  
 421 )  
 422 )  
 423 )  
 424 )  
 425 )  
 426 )  
 427 )  
 428 )  
 429 )  
 430 )  
 431 )  
 432 )  
 433 )  
 434 )  
 435 )  
 436 )  
 437 )  
 438 )  
 439 )  
 440 )  
 441 )  
 442 )  
 443 )  
 444 )  
 445 )  
 446 )  
 447 )  
 448 )  
 449 )  
 450 )  
 451 )  
 452 )  
 453 )  
 454 )  
 455 )  
 456 )  
 457 )  
 458 )  
 459 )  
 460 )  
 461 )  
 462 )  
 463 )  
 464 )  
 465 )  
 466 )  
 467 )  
 468 )  
 469 )  
 470 )  
 471 )  
 472 )  
 473 )  
 474 )  
 475 )  
 476 )  
 477 )  
 478 )  
 479 )  
 480 )  
 481 )  
 482 )  
 483 )  
 484 )  
 485 )  
 486 )  
 487 )  
 488 )  
 489 )  
 490 )  
 491 )  
 492 )  
 493 )  
 494 )  
 495 )  
 496 )  
 497 )  
 498 )  
 499 )  
 500 )  
 501 )  
 502 )  
 503 )  
 504 )  
 505 )  
 506 )  
 507 )  
 508 )  
 509 )  
 510 )  
 511 )  
 512 )  
 513 )  
 514 )  
 515 )  
 516 )  
 517 )  
 518 )  
 519 )  
 520 )  
 521 )  
 522 )  
 523 )  
 524 )  
 525 )  
 526 )  
 527 )  
 528 )  
 529 )  
 530 )  
 531 )  
 532 )  
 533 )  
 534 )  
 535 )  
 536 )  
 537 )  
 538 )  
 539 )  
 540 )  
 541 )  
 542 )  
 543 )  
 544 )  
 545 )  
 546 )  
 547 )  
 548 )  
 549 )  
 550 )  
 551 )  
 552 )  
 553 )  
 554 )  
 555 )  
 556 )  
 557 )  
 558 )  
 559 )  
 560 )  
 561 )  
 562 )  
 563 )  
 564 )  
 565 )  
 566 )  
 567 )  
 568 )  
 569 )  
 570 )  
 571 )  
 572 )  
 573 )  
 574 )  
 575 )  
 576 )  
 577 )  
 578 )  
 579 )  
 580 )  
 581 )  
 582 )  
 583 )  
 584 )  
 585 )  
 586 )  
 587 )  
 588 )  
 589 )  
 590 )  
 591 )  
 592 )  
 593 )  
 594 )  
 595 )  
 596 )  
 597 )  
 598 )  
 599 )  
 600 )  
 601 )  
 602 )  
 603 )  
 604 )  
 605 )  
 606 )  
 607 )  
 608 )  
 609 )  
 610 )  
 611 )  
 612 )  
 613 )  
 614 )  
 615 )  
 616 )  
 617 )  
 618 )  
 619 )  
 620 )  
 621 )  
 622 )  
 623 )  
 624 )  
 625 )  
 626 )  
 627 )  
 628 )  
 629 )  
 630 )  
 631 )  
 632 )  
 633 )  
 634 )  
 635 )  
 636 )  
 637 )  
 638 )  
 639 )  
 640 )  
 641 )  
 642 )  
 643 )  
 644 )  
 645 )  
 646 )  
 647 )  
 648 )  
 649 )  
 650 )  
 651 )  
 652 )  
 653 )  
 654 )  
 655 )  
 656 )  
 657 )  
 658 )  
 659 )  
 660 )  
 661 )  
 662 )  
 663 )  
 664 )  
 665 )  
 666 )  
 667 )  
 668 )  
 669 )  
 670 )  
 671 )  
 672 )  
 673 )  
 674 )  
 675 )  
 676 )  
 677 )  
 678 )  
 679 )  
 680 )  
 681 )  
 682 )  
 683 )  
 684 )  
 685 )  
 686 )  
 687 )  
 688 )  
 689 )  
 690 )  
 691 )  
 692 )  
 693 )  
 694 )  
 695 )  
 696 )  
 697 )  
 698 )  
 699 )  
 700 )  
 701 )  
 702 )  
 703 )  
 704 )  
 705 )  
 706 )  
 707 )  
 708 )  
 709 )  
 710 )  
 711 )  
 712 )  
 713 )  
 714 )  
 715 )  
 716 )  
 717 )  
 718 )  
 719 )  
 720 )  
 721 )  
 722 )  
 723 )  
 724 )  
 725 )  
 726 )  
 727 )  
 728 )  
 729 )  
 730 )  
 731 )  
 732 )  
 733 )  
 734 )  
 735 )  
 736 )  
 737 )  
 738 )  
 739 )  
 740 )  
 741 )  
 742 )  
 743 )  
 744 )  
 745 )  
 746 )  
 747 )  
 748 )  
 749 )  
 750 )  
 751 )  
 752 )  
 753 )  
 754 )  
 755 )  
 756 )  
 757 )  
 758 )  
 759 )  
 760 )  
 761 )  
 762 )  
 763 )  
 764 )  
 765 )  
 766 )  
 767 )  
 768 )  
 769 )  
 770 )  
 771 )  
 772 )  
 773 )  
 774 )  
 775 )  
 776 )  
 777 )  
 778 )  
 779 )  
 780 )  
 781 )  
 782 )  
 783 )  
 784 )  
 785 )  
 786 )  
 787 )  
 788 )  
 789 )  
 790 )  
 791 )  
 792 )  
 793 )  
 794 )  
 795 )  
 796 )  
 797 )  
 798 )  
 799 )  
 800 )  
 801 )  
 802 )  
 803 )  
 804 )  
 805 )  
 806 )  
 807 )  
 808 )  
 809 )  
 810 )  
 811 )  
 812 )  
 813 )  
 814 )  
 815 )  
 816 )  
 817 )  
 818 )  
 819 )  
 820 )  
 821 )  
 822 )  
 823 )  
 824 )  
 825 )  
 826 )  
 827 )  
 828 )  
 829 )  
 830 )  
 831 )  
 832 )  
 833 )  
 834 )  
 835 )  
 836 )  
 837 )  
 838 )  
 839 )  
 840 )  
 841 )  
 842 )  
 843 )  
 844 )  
 845 )  
 846 )  
 847 )  
 848 )  
 849 )  
 850 )  
 851 )  
 852 )  
 853 )  
 854 )  
 855 )  
 856 )  
 857 )  
 858 )  
 859 )  
 860 )  
 861 )  
 862 )  
 863 )  
 864 )  
 865 )  
 866 )  
 867 )  
 868 )  
 869 )  
 870 )  
 871 )  
 872 )  
 873 )  
 874 )  
 875 )  
 876 )  
 877 )  
 878 )  
 879 )  
 880 )  
 881 )  
 882 )  
 883 )  
 884 )  
 885 )  
 886 )  
 887 )  
 888 )  
 889 )  
 890 )  
 891 )  
 892 )  
 893 )  
 894 )  
 895 )  
 896 )  
 897 )  
 898 )  
 899 )  
 900 )  
 901 )  
 902 )  
 903 )  
 904 )  
 905 )  
 906 )  
 907 )  
 908 )  
 909 )  
 910 )  
 911 )  
 912 )  
 913 )  
 914 )  
 915 )  
 916 )  
 917 )  
 918 )  
 919 )  
 920 )  
 921 )  
 922 )  
 923 )  
 924 )  
 925 )  
 926 )  
 927 )  
 928 )  
 929 )  
 930 )  
 931 )  
 932 )  
 933 )  
 934 )  
 935 )  
 936 )  
 937 )  
 938 )  
 939 )  
 940 )  
 941 )  
 942 )  
 943 )  
 944 )  
 945 )  
 946 )  
 947 )  
 948 )  
 949 )  
 950 )  
 951 )  
 952 )  
 953 )  
 954 )  
 955 )  
 956 )  
 957 )  
 958 )  
 959 )  
 960 )  
 961 )  
 962 )  
 963 )  
 964 )  
 965 )  
 966 )  
 967 )  
 968 )  
 969 )  
 970 )  
 971 )  
 972 )  
 973 )  
 974 )  
 975 )  
 976 )  
 977 )  
 978 )  
 979 )  
 980 )  
 981 )  
 982 )  
 983 )  
 984 )  
 985 )  
 986 )  
 987 )  
 988 )  
 989 )  
 990 )  
 991 )  
 992 )  
 993 )  
 994 )  
 995 )  
 996 )  
 997 )  
 998 )  
 999 )  
 1000 )

1           The parties to the above-entitled action jointly submit this JOINT CASE  
2 MANAGEMENT STATEMENT & PROPOSED ORDER pursuant to the *Standing Order for All*  
3 *Judges of the Northern District of California* and Civil Local Rule 16-9.

4           **1. Jurisdiction & Service**

5           Plaintiff's Statement: As reflected in the Complaint (ECF No. 1), Plaintiff alleges this  
6 Court has subject matter jurisdiction pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1332(d) (the Class Action Fairness  
7 Act ("CAFA")). *See* Compl., ¶ 44.

8           Defendant's Statement: For the reasons articulated in Defendant's motion to dismiss  
9 (ECF No. 24), Defendant believes that the Court lacks subject matter jurisdiction over this dispute  
10 because Plaintiff lacks standing – he has suffered no legally cognizable injury and any purported  
11 injury is not fairly traceable to Defendant.

12           Joint Statement: The parties are not aware of any issues regarding personal jurisdiction  
13 or venue. Defendant was served on 9/22/2022.

14           **2. Facts**

15           Plaintiff's Statement: This case arises from Defendant's misappropriation of Plaintiff's  
16 and Class members' names, contact information, job titles, places of work, cities of residence,  
17 and other personal information to advertise paid subscriptions to their  
18 websites, [www.cognism.com](http://www.cognism.com) and [www.kaspr.io](http://www.kaspr.io), without Plaintiff's and Class members' consent.  
19 Compl., ¶¶1-3. Cognism advertises subscriptions primarily to salespeople and marketers by  
20 publicly displaying profiles of the Plaintiff and Class Members showing their names, contact  
21 information, and other personal information to users on a free trial basis. *Id.* ¶¶4-7. Cognism gives  
22 trial users the ability to view and download profiles for a limited amount of time and, after that  
23 limit is reached, trial users who attempts to view or download additional Plaintiff or Class  
24 Member profiles receive messages prompting them to purchase a paid subscription that provides  
25 a variety of advertised services, such as "Intent data" about "business web user's observed  
26 behavior – specifically web content consumption – that provides insight into their interests."  
27 Cognism promises to inform the subscriber which "articles and reviews" the prospect has read,  
28

1 which “whitepapers” the prospect has downloaded, and what “websites” the prospect has visited.  
2 Id. ¶15-17. Defendant is the sole author, designer, and implementor of these advertising  
3 techniques and messages. Id. at ¶32. Plaintiff did not give his consent for Cognism to use his  
4 name and persona to advertise subscriptions to its website. Id. at ¶¶37. Additional facts supporting  
5 Plaintiff’s causes of action are in the Complaint.

6 There are many common facts, including: whether Cognism knowingly uses the names,  
7 personal information, and personas of Plaintiff and the Class to advertise website subscriptions;  
8 whether Cognism displays or displayed the Plaintiff’s name, personal information, and persona  
9 on its website; whether Cognism asked for, or received, consent from, or provided compensation  
10 to, Plaintiff and the Class for the use of their names, personal information, and personas; and  
11 whether and how Cognism has benefited from its use of Plaintiff’s and the Class’s names,  
12 personal information, and personas.

13 Defendant’s Statement: Cognism is a sales lead generation platform that helps companies  
14 connect with potential customers. To facilitate such connections, Cognism collects information  
15 about business professionals, such as their employer, job title, office location, and contact  
16 information.

17 Cognism’s aggregated database of verified information about business professionals is  
18 available through Cognism’s platform, which allows an individual to search by various criteria to  
19 identify potential sales leads. Cognism allows potential customers the opportunity to try its  
20 platform through a free trial, which permits the trial user to use the full platform for a limited  
21 period of time or for a limited number of contact information downloads.

22 Information concerning Plaintiff was obtained by Cognism from third-party data sellers.  
23 That information is contained within the Cognism platform. Although Plaintiff asserts that  
24 “Cognism displays a profile of personal information about Mr. Kis on [www.cognism.com](http://www.cognism.com), which  
25 Cognism intends to be used by B2B marketers and salespeople who wish to contact Mr. Kis with  
26 unsolicited promotions,” Compl. ¶ 59, the only way Plaintiff’s information could possibly appear  
27 to any user of Cognism’s platform would be when the platform itself was actually used --

1 Plaintiff's name and information were never listed on Cognism's public-facing website, and never  
2 used in any promotional material or advertisement.

3 In fact, the only time Plaintiff's information was ever accessed on the Cognism platform  
4 was when Plaintiff's own attorney misrepresented himself as a potential Cognism customer to  
5 gain access to the Cognism platform, and then did his own search for Mr. Kis. On that basis,  
6 Plaintiff advances statutory right-of-publicity and California common law misappropriation  
7 claims. Plaintiff also advances a CIPA claim based on his assertion that information about  
8 Plaintiff was obtained by Cognism through wire interception of emails. This never occurred.  
9

10 **3. Legal Issues**

11 The principal legal issues are: (1) whether Plaintiff has satisfied his burden of alleging a  
12 legally cognizable injury-in-fact that is fairly traceable to Defendant's conduct for purposes of  
13 Article III standing; (2) whether Plaintiff states claims under California's Right of Publicity  
14 Statute (Cal. Civ. Code § 3344), California's Invasion of Privacy Act (Cal. Pen. Code §§ 630 *et*  
15 *seq.*), California's tort of appropriation of a name or likeness, and California's Unfair  
16 Competition Law (Cal. Bus. & Prof. Code § 17200 *et seq.*); and (3) whether Plaintiff satisfies  
17 the requirements for class certification pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 23(b)(2) and (b)(3).

18 **4. Motions**

19 On December 12, 2022, Defendant moved to dismiss Plaintiff's claims because Plaintiff  
20 does not have Article III standing and Plaintiff fails to state statutory right-of-publicity, common  
21 law misappropriation, CIPA and UCL claims. ECF No. 24. Plaintiff's opposition is due January  
22 27, 2023, and Defendant's reply is due February 17, 2023. The motion hearing is scheduled for  
23 March 16, 2023.

24 Pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(c), Defendant will seek leave to move for  
25 a protective order to stay discovery pending the Court's resolution of Defendant's motion to  
26 dismiss. Pursuant to Your Honor's Individual Rule L, the parties have met-and-conferred  
27 regarding a limited stay of discovery and have been unable to reach a resolution through this  
28

1 process. On January 17, 2023, the parties submitted a joint letter to apprise the Court of this  
2 discovery dispute.

3 **5. Amendment of Pleadings**

4 The parties reserve the right to make amendments to pleadings if and when appropriate,  
5 and as permitted by court rules.

6 **6. Evidence Preservation**

7 The parties have reviewed the Guidelines Relating to the Discovery of  
8 Electronically Stored Information (“ESI Guidelines”) and have met and conferred pursuant to  
9 Fed. R. Civ. P. 26(f) regarding reasonable and proportionate steps taken to preserve evidence  
10 relevant to the issues reasonably evident in this action. The parties have taken reasonable steps  
11 to preserve discoverable information in its possession, custody, or control. The parties will  
12 continue to discuss whether and to what extent any additional steps may be necessary to ensure  
13 the preservation of relevant evidence.

14 **7. Disclosures**

15 The parties exchanged their initial disclosures on January 17, 2023.

16 Plaintiff’s Statement: Plaintiff disclosed information consistent with his obligations under  
17 Fed R. Civ. P. 26(a)(1)(A).

18 Defendant’s Statement: Defendant disclosed the names and contact information of  
19 individuals likely to have discoverable information, descriptions of documents and information  
20 that may be used to support its claims or defenses, and any relevant insurance agreements pursuant  
21 to Fed R. Civ. P. 26(a)(1)(A).

22 **8. Discovery (and Discovery Plan Pursuant to Fed R. Civ. P. 26(f)(2) and 26(f)(3))**

23 Joint Statement: The parties held their Rule 26(f) conference on January 3, 2023. Initial  
24 disclosures were served on January 17, 2023, without any modifications to the timing, form, or  
25 requirement of the initial disclosures. No additional discovery has been taken to date.

26 The parties agree that a protective order governing the use of confidential business  
27 information and other confidential material and a Rule 502(d) order to protect against the waiver

1 of privilege are appropriate in this case. The parties intend to jointly submit to the Court for  
2 approval a protective order based on the Northern District of California's model order, modified  
3 as necessary to account for the particular confidentiality concerns in this case. The parties also  
4 intend to jointly submit to the Court for approval an order regarding the discovery of  
5 electronically stored information based on the Northern District of California's model order,  
6 modified as necessary to account for the particular discovery concerns in this case.

7 At this time, the parties do not propose any limitations or modifications of the discovery  
8 rules other than as stated above and below regarding Defendant's intention to seek a stay of  
9 discovery at this time, and do not have any other concerns about the disclosure, discovery, or  
10 preservation of electronically stored material. The parties do not have any issues to raise about  
11 claims of privilege or of protection as trial-preparation materials.

12 Plaintiff's Statement: Plaintiff believes that discovery should proceed immediately,  
13 consistent with the Federal Rules. Plaintiff proposes that fact discovery should close on February  
14 15, 2024. Plaintiff anticipates seeking from Cognism and/or relevant third parties documents and  
15 information concerning: (1) Defendant's use of Plaintiff's and Class members' names, personal  
16 information, and personas to advertise its products; (2) Defendant's subscription models, sales  
17 models, and advertising strategies; (3) The value of Plaintiff's and Class members' names,  
18 personal information, and personas in attracting and retaining subscribers and/or purchasers; (4)  
19 Defendant's collection of Plaintiff's and Class members' names, personal information, and  
20 personas; (5) Any purported consent by Plaintiff and the Class to Defendant's use of their names,  
21 personal information, and personas; (6) Defendant's revenue from its use of Plaintiff's and Class  
22 members' names, personal information, and personas; (7) Any licensing agreements under which  
23 Cognism either earns or pays a fee to license Plaintiff's and Class members' names, personal  
24 information, and personas; (8) Defendant's insurance coverage for legal claims; (9) Internal or  
25 external communications expressing or addressing privacy and/or intellectual property concerns  
26 regarding Defendant's use of names, personal information, and personas; (10) The size of the  
27 Class and the names of Class members; (11) Any affirmative defenses Defendant intends to assert.

1 Plaintiff reserves the right to seek additional categories of documents, testimony, and other  
2 information as the case develops.

3 Defendant's Statement: Defendant believes that discussions concerning the anticipated  
4 scope of discovery, proposed limitations or modifications to the discovery rules, and a stipulated  
5 ESI and/or protective order are premature in light of Defendant's motion to dismiss the complaint,  
6 as Defendant believes the resolution of the motion will substantially narrow the claims and issues  
7 in this case, if the complaint is not entirely dismissed in its entirety. Defendant intends to move  
8 for a protective order to stay discovery pending resolution of Defendant's motion to dismiss.

9 Notwithstanding Defendant's motion for protective order to stay discovery, Defendant  
10 believes that discovery should occur in two phases upon resolution of the motion to dismiss: (1) a  
11 phase of discovery limited to individual claims, followed by (2) a phase of discovery focused on  
12 class claims.

13 As to Plaintiff, Defendant anticipates needing discovery on the following subjects:  
14

- 15 • All documents and communications supporting Plaintiff's allegations in the  
Complaint;
- 16 • All documents and communications concerning any investigation by Plaintiff or  
Plaintiff's counsel concerning Plaintiff's allegations in the Complaint, including  
but not limited to whether Plaintiff's name appeared on Defendant's website and  
whether Plaintiff's information was intercepted by Defendant;
- 17 • All documents prepared by investigators or consultants for Plaintiff that are  
relevant to any potential claims or defenses in this litigation;
- 18 • All documents and communications between Plaintiff and Plaintiff's counsel pre-  
dating Plaintiff's retention of counsel;
- 19 • All documents and communications concerning Plaintiff's engagement of counsel  
and the circumstances of such engagement;
- 20 • All documents and communications between Plaintiff and Defendant concerning  
the inclusion of Plaintiff's information on Defendant's platform, including but not  
limited to opt-out notices provided to Plaintiff;
- 21 • All documents and communications concerning Plaintiff's decision to opt out or  
not to opt out of inclusion of Plaintiff's information in Defendant's platform;
- 22 • All documents and communications supporting Plaintiff's claimed damages  
arising from the Complaint, including the calculation of any claimed actual  
damages;

- 1 • Documents sufficient to identify Plaintiff's document retention policy/practice;
- 2 • Documents that Plaintiff contends constitute an admission on the part of Defendant  
with regard to the matters which are the subject of this action;
- 3 • All documents prepared by experts who Plaintiff intends to call at trial; and
- 4 • All documents that Plaintiff intends to offer at trial.

5  
6 Defendant reserves the right to seek additional categories of documents, testimony, and  
7 other information as the case develops.

8 **9. Class Actions**

9 Plaintiff's Statement: Plaintiff provides the following information as required by Civ.  
10 L.R. 16-9(b). As alleged in the Complaint, this action is maintainable as a class action under Fed.  
11 R. Civ. P. 23(b)(2). *See* Compl., ¶88. Plaintiff contends that it is also maintainable as a class action  
12 under Fed. R. Civ. P. 23(b)(3). *Id.* Plaintiff seeks to represent the following classes:

13 **Cognism.com class:** All current and former California residents who are not subscribers  
14 of cognism.com and whose names and personal information Cognism incorporated in  
15 profiles used to promote paid subscriptions to cognism.com.

16 **Kaspr.io class:** All current and former California residents who are not subscribers of  
17 kaspr.io, who have profiles on the professional networking site LinkedIn, and whose  
18 names and personal information Kaspr used to promote paid subscriptions to kaspr.io..

19 Plaintiff contends that the Complaint alleges facts showing Plaintiff is entitled to maintain  
20 this action under Fed. R. Civ. P. 23. *See* Compl., at ¶¶88-97. Defendant disagrees that this action  
21 is maintainable as a class action. The parties propose that the deadline for Plaintiff's class  
22 certification motion be March 15, 2024.

23 Defendant's Statement: Defendant believes that class certification under Fed. R. Civ.  
24 P. 26(b)(2) or 26(b)(3) are both inappropriate in this case. There likely will be significant  
25 variations among class members with respect to the inclusion of their information on the  
26 Defendant's platform and the extent to which any individual class member's emails were  
27 collected or reviewed by Defendant such that Plaintiff will be unable to provide a common  
28

1 method to prove impact and damages, and common issues of law and fact will not predominate.  
2 A class action would thus not be a superior means for fairly and efficiently adjudicating the  
3 controversy. Moreover, Plaintiff also has not suffered any legally cognizable or particularized  
4 injury as his information was never displayed on Defendant's website nor were his emails ever  
5 collected or reviewed by Defendant; thus, Plaintiff cannot adequately represent the putative  
6 classes. To the extent there are certain common issues of law applicable to all members of the  
7 putative classes, those common issues will result in dismissal of the action.

8 Counsel for Defendant has reviewed the Procedural Guidance for Class Action  
9 Settlements.

10 **10. Related Cases**

11 There are no related cases.

12 **11. Relief**

13 Plaintiff's Statement: As described in the Complaint, Plaintiff, on behalf of the proposed  
14 Class, seeks the following relief: statutory damages in the amount of \$750 per violation (under  
15 California law on behalf of the Class); statutory damages in the amount of \$5,000 for each email  
16 Cognism intercepted, eavesdropped upon, read the contents of, and/or disclosed the contents of  
17 (under CIPA); Defendant's profits earned from its misuse of Plaintiff's and Class members'  
18 information; compensatory damages for mental anguish; disgorgement of Defendant's unjust  
19 benefits earned from its use of Plaintiff's and Class members' names, personal information, and  
20 personas; an injunction prohibiting Defendant's illegal actions; nominal damages; a declaration  
21 that defendant's actions are illegal; and an award of attorneys' fees and costs. *See* Compl., ¶¶88-  
22 127. Because discovery has not yet begun and only Cognism has the information needed to  
23 establish the size of the class, number of violations, and amount of profits earned, Plaintiff is not  
24 yet able to estimate the total amount of damages sought.

25 Defendant's Statement: For the reasons articulated in Defendant's motion to dismiss  
26 (ECF No. 24), Plaintiff is not entitled to any recovery, including declaratory or injunctive relief  
27 and fees. Defendant seeks no relief through counterclaim but has provided Plaintiff notice to

1 Plaintiff's counsel, pursuant to Rule 11, that his claims are without merit. Defendant reserves all  
 2 rights, including the right to seek sanctions and fees.

3 **12. Settlement and ADR**

4 The parties have each filed their respective ADR Certifications pursuant to ADR L.R.  
 5 3-5(b). The parties are willing to discuss the possibility of a settlement conference before a  
 6 Magistrate Judge not presiding over this action or a private mediator.

7 **13. Other References**

8 The parties do not believe this case is suitable for reference to binding arbitration, a special  
 9 master, or the Judicial Panel on Multidistrict Litigation.

10 **14. Narrowing of Issues**

11 The parties do not believe there are any issues that can be narrowed by agreement or by  
 12 motion at this time and do not have any suggestions to expedite the presentation of evidence at  
 13 trial. The parties reserve the right to bring motions, including summary judgment motions, at the  
 14 appropriate time.

15 **15. Expedited Trial Procedure**

16 The parties do not believe this case is suitable for expedited trial.

17 **16. Scheduling**

18 Plaintiff's Statement: Plaintiff proposes the following schedule:

Event	Deadline
Initial Disclosures	January 18, 2023
Completion of Fact Discovery	February 15, 2024
Plaintiff's Motion for Class Certification and Class Certification Expert Disclosures	March 15, 2024
Defendant's Opposition to Class Certification Motion and Opposing Expert reports	April 26, 2024
Plaintiff's Class Certification Motion Reply and Rebuttal Expert Reports	May 31, 2024
Opening Merits Experts Reports	30 days after an order on Plaintiff's motion for class certification
Rebuttal Merits Expert Reports	60 days after an order on Plaintiff's motion for class certification

Completion of Expert Discovery	90 days after an order on Plaintiff's motion for class certification
Dispositive Motions, including Daubert Motions	120 days after an order on Plaintiff's motion for class certification
Trial Ready Date	90 days after an order on any dispositive motions

Defendant's Statement: Defendant believes that it is premature to set a case schedule before resolution of Defendants' motion to dismiss, because the Court's decision on the motion to dismiss may significantly narrow the claims and issues in this action, which may in turn alter the scope of discovery and the need for further motion practice. Defendant suggests that the Court schedule a case management conference after the ruling on Defendants' motion to dismiss to discuss scheduling matters.

Notwithstanding Defendant's position on scheduling, Defendant proposes that the case proceed according to the following sequence of events, which contemplates phased discovery—first on Plaintiff's individual claims, followed by discovery on the class claims—to facilitate the just and efficient resolution of this action:

	<u>Deadline</u>	<u>Date</u>
	Hearing on Defendant's Motion to Dismiss	3/16/2023
	Answer / Close of Pleadings	TBD
Individual Claims	Close of Fact Discovery re: Individual Claims	TBD
	Opening Expert Reports re: Individual Claims	TBD
	Rebuttal Expert Reports re: Individual Claims	TBD
	Reply Expert Reports re: Individual Claims	TBD
	Close of Expert Discovery re: Individual Claims	TBD
	Plaintiff's Summary Judgment Opening Brief ( <i>assuming parties will file cross-motions for summary judgment on individual claims</i> )	TBD
	Defendant's Summary Judgment Opening/Opposition Brief	TBD
	Plaintiff's Opposition/Reply Brief	TBD
	Defendant's Reply Brief	TBD
	Hearing On Summary Judgment Motions	TBD
Class Claims	Close of Fact Discovery re: Class Claims	TBD
	Plaintiff's Motion for Class Certification / Opening Expert Reports re: Class Claims	TBD
	Defendant's Opposition to Motion for Class Certification / Rebuttal Expert Reports re: Class Claims	TBD
	Plaintiff's Reply ISO Class Certification / Reply Expert Reports re: Class Claims	TBD
	Close of Expert Discovery re: Class Claims	TBD

	Hearing on Plaintiff's Motion for Class Certification	TBD
	Pretrial conference	TBD
	Trial	TBD

1           **17. Trial**

2           Joint Statement: The parties request a jury trial for all claims.

3           Plaintiff's Statement: Plaintiff anticipates the trial lasting fourteen days.

4           Defendant's Statement: Defendant cannot yet estimate the expected length of the trial  
 5 because, among other reasons, it is unknown which, if any, claims will survive Defendant's  
 6 motion to dismiss and whether a class will be certified.

7           **18. Disclosure of Non-party Interested Entities or Persons**

8           Plaintiff's Statement: Plaintiff certifies pursuant to Civil L.R. 3-15 that, to his knowledge,  
 9 there are no persons or entities other than the Plaintiff and members of the proposed Class who  
 10 have a financial or other kind of interest in this proceeding.

11           Defendant's Statement: Defendant filed its Civil Local Rule 3-15 statement on December  
 12, 2022. Other than the named party and Cognism Inc.'s parent corporation, there is no conflict  
 13 or interest to report.

14           **19. Professional Conduct**

15           All attorneys of record have reviewed the Guidelines for Professional Conduct for the  
 16 Northern District of California.

17           **20. Other**

18           The parties are not aware of any other matters that may facilitate the just, speedy, and  
 19 inexpensive resolution of this matter.

1 Respectfully submitted,

2 Dated: January 17, 2023

*/s/ Michael F. Ram*

---

3 Michael F. Ram (SBN 104805)  
4 [mram@forthepeople.com](mailto:mram@forthepeople.com)  
5 Marie N. Appel (SBN 187483)  
6 [mappel@forthepeople.com](mailto:mappel@forthepeople.com)  
7 MORGAN & MORGAN  
COMPLEX LITIGATION GROUP  
711 Van Ness Avenue, Suite 500  
San Francisco, CA 94102  
Telephone: (415) 358-6913

8 Benjamin R. Osborn (to be admitted Pro Hac Vice)  
9 102 Bergen St.  
10 Brooklyn, NY 11201  
Telephone: (347) 645-0464  
Email: [ben@benosbornlaw.com](mailto:ben@benosbornlaw.com)

11 Sam Strauss (to be admitted Pro Hac Vice)  
12 [sam@turkestrauss.com](mailto:sam@turkestrauss.com)  
13 Raina Borrelli (to be admitted Pro Hac Vice)  
14 [raina@turkestrauss.com](mailto:raina@turkestrauss.com)  
15 TURKE & STRAUSS LLP  
613 Williamson St., Suite 201  
Madison, Wisconsin 53703-3515  
Telephone: (608) 237-1775  
Facsimile: (509) 4423

16 *Counsel for Plaintiff*

1  
2  
3  
4 Dated: January 17, 2023

*/s/ Michael S. Sommer*

---

5  
6 Michael S. Sommer (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
7 JaeYoung Ariel Jeong (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
8 Derek K. Mong (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
9 WILSON SONSINI GOODRICH & ROSATI  
10 Professional Corporation  
11 1301 Avenue of the Americas, 40th Floor  
12 New York, NY 10019-6022  
13 Telephone: (212) 999-5800  
14 Facsimile: (212) 999-5899  
Email: msommer@wsgr.com  
ajeong@wsgr.com  
dmong@wsgr.com

15 Colleen Bal, State Bar No. 167637  
16 WILSON SONSINI GOODRICH & ROSATI  
17 Professional Corporation  
18 One Market Plaza Spear Tower, Suite 3300  
19 San Francisco, CA 94105  
20 Telephone: (415) 947-2000  
21 Facsimile: (415) 947-2099  
22 Email: cbal@wsgr.com

23 *Counsel for Defendant Cognism, Inc.*

## CASE MANAGEMENT ORDER

The above JOINT CASE MANAGEMENT STATEMENT & PROPOSED ORDER is approved as the Case Management Order for this case and all parties shall comply with its provisions. [In addition, the Court makes the further orders stated below:]

IT IS SO ORDERED.

Dated:

Hon. Jon S. Tigar  
United States District Court Judge